Designing Critical Reflection to Generate, Deepen, and Document Learning

Facilitator:

Patti H. Clayton
Practitioner-Scholar, PHC Ventures
Senior Scholar, Center for Service and Learning, IUPUI
Visiting Scholar, Institute for Community and Economic Engagement, UNCG
Visiting Fellow, New England Resource Center for Higher Education, UMass-Boston

[patti.clayton@curricularengagement.com] [www.curricularengagement.com]

UNC Wilmington
July 30, 2013
What is Experiential / Applied Learning?

**Version 1**

Students enrolled in a First Year Inquiry course, “Humans and the Environment,” picked up trash alongside senior citizens one Saturday morning in September and helped construct new habitats at an animal sanctuary one Saturday morning in October.

**Version 2**

Students enrolled in a First Year Inquiry course, “Humans and the Environment,” picked up trash alongside senior citizens one Saturday morning in September and helped construct new habitats at an animal sanctuary one Saturday morning in October. Before each activity they learned about the organization from its webpage and wrote briefly about their expectations and objectives; after each activity they discussed it in class and wrote a two-page paper analyzing the experience from personal, civic, and academic perspectives.

**Version 3?**
Conceptual Framework for EL/AL

**Components (integrated)**

- Academic material
- Relevant experience
- Critical reflection

**Categories of Learning**
(critical thinking in all)

- eTEAL SLOs

**Partners (co-roles/reciprocity)**

- Students
- Faculty/staff
- ???

- Academic learning
- Other?

PHC Ventures, 2013
Reflect on ...
DEAL
Conceptualizing Integrated Design

Learning Goals

Teaching & Learning Strategies

Assessment Strategies
Designing Reflection Mechanisms in Light of Learning Goals / Assessment Strategies

What are the similarities and differences among these reflection mechanisms (Teacher Education course)? Under what conditions might you use each of these?

Example reflection mechanism #1:
“Seek to understand rather than to be understood” (Peace Prayer of St. Francis)

➢ Describe a recent conversation or conflict.
➢ Did you primarily try to make yourself heard, to be sure that your position was represented, or did you prioritize instead understanding the other person? Why, and with what consequences?
➢ Identify other examples of when you have taken each approach and the consequences.
➢ Do you see any pattern(s) across these examples?
➢ What might be the source(s) of your general tendencies here?
➢ Do you believe you need to make any changes in the way you communicate with others along these lines? Specifically, with students? If so, what might those changes be?
➢ In what specific ways might you act on this understanding of communication in the future, generally and with your students?

Example reflection mechanism #2:
List and explain 2 of your strengths and 2 of your weaknesses. Share with a neighbor. Together, select the strength and the weakness that, for each of you, are most likely to emerge in your role as a teacher.

Example reflection mechanism #3:
According to Parker Palmer, “limitations are the flip side of our gifts ... a particular weakness is the inevitable trade-off of a particular strength.” There is nothing “wrong” with us that we need to “fix,” he suggests. Rather, we are who we are; sometimes our personal characteristics serve us well (and we think of them as strengths), and sometimes they serve us ill (and we think of them as weaknesses). [Let Your Life Speak, 2000]

Individually and in writing ...
➢ Identify and explain a personal characteristic that you tend to think of as a weakness in your role as a teacher.
➢ Apply Palmer’s discussion: What gift or strength do you think this “weakness” might be the flip side of?

Discuss with a neighbor ...
➢ Compare and contrast a teaching-related situation in which the weakness emerged and one in which the flip side strength emerged. Why do you think each emerged as it did and what were the consequences?
➢ If Palmer is correct regarding the relationship between our strengths and weaknesses, what do you think are the implications for your teaching and for your approach to personal and professional development as a teacher? Specifically, what changes might you want to make?

Individually and in writing ...
➢ Do you agree with Palmer? Why or why not?

Example reflection mechanism #4: Reflect on your strengths and weaknesses

Example reflection mechanism #5: List and explain 2 of your strengths and 2 of your weaknesses
What Learning Are You After (eTEAL)?

1. The student will articulate their expectations, the purpose, and/or the goals of the experience in terms of their personal educational development. [Thoughtful Expression]

2. The student will synthesize knowledge drawn from their coursework to address the issues/challenges/questions involved in the experience. [Critical Thinking, Foundational Knowledge, Inquiry]

3. The student will communicate the impact or significance on their personal educational development and on others in the profession or in the field at the conclusion of the experience. [Critical Thinking]

In your specific context …

What knowledge in particular?
What does it mean to synthesize that knowledge?
What might be the issues/challenges/questions involved in the experience?
What does it mean to address them?

In other words, what does this SLO mean, precisely, in your context? What would be an example of a student demonstrating this SLO well?
Reclaiming Reflection

“Reflection”                          “Critical reflection”

Rate any given reflection activity/assignment and note potential changes to move it (in perception and in actuality) closer to 10:
What is Critical Reflection?

“Experience is the best teacher – Or is it?”
(Conrad and Hedin)

“What is Critical Reflection?”

“active, persistent and careful consideration of any belief or supposed form of knowledge in the light of the grounds that support it, and the further conclusions to which it tends”


“a continual interweaving of thinking and doing”


to “integrate the understanding gained into one’s experience in order to enable better choices or actions in the future as well as enhance one’s overall effectiveness”


“We had the experience but missed the meaning”

Eliot, T.S (1943) The Four Quartets

Critical Reflection

1) Generates
2) Deepens
3) Documents

Learning
PAUSE
Implications of our discussion this morning for my design of critical reflection in AL / for me and my students and partners
Designing Critical Reflection :: Unpacking Local Examples

Example #1

Context
Community Health Nursing
Course description: Introduces the core concepts of professional nursing essential to the role of the professional nurse when caring for aggregates of clients in the community. Course contents emphasize the relationships between the community nursing process and client centered care, clinical reasoning, and integrity of practice applied risk reduction, health prevention and promotion of individuals, families, and aggregates in diverse community settings. Adopted theories from epidemiology, sociology, nursing, and environmental management are related to the aggregate client centered care and quality improvement. Application of concepts and essential psychomotor skills are demonstrated in a clinical experience using advanced technology and working with clients in selected clinical agencies. Satisfies University Studies II: Approaches and Perspectives / Living in Our Diverse Nation. Satisfies University Studies VI: Common Requirements / Capstone Course.

Assignment
1. Are there any ideas or other information from classroom readings, activities or discussions in this course or other prior classes that you used in your clinical experiences, and how did your clinical experiences help to solidify (or challenge) this information or these ideas?.

2. What did you learn about yourself, others (colleagues, clients other community members), or how things work through any of your clinical experiences (including the reflective day exercise and presentations) in this course? How did they affect what you did or did not think, feel, decide or do? How did it affect what you decided to do while participating in your clinical field work? Did you learn something about others' perspectives that you may not have thought of before?

3. What do you consider to be the most important thing you have you learned about community and community health so far? Why?

4. How will what you have learned from these clinical experiences influence your future work/research/career?
Worksheet

Initial thoughts on example #1:

\[ \begin{array}{c|c}
\text{Plus (I like)} & \text{Delta (I would change)} \\
\end{array} \]

Of what we have discussed so far today, what could be most helpful in enhancing this assignment?

How, specifically, would you enhance it? Notes here and/or mark-up the example itself.

What questions does examining it lead you to consider for critical reflection in your context?
Worksheet

Initial response to example #2 (see separate copy):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plus (I like)</th>
<th>Delta (I would change)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Of what we have discussed so far today, what could be most helpful in enhancing this assignment?

How, specifically, would you enhance it? Notes here and/or mark-up the example itself.

What questions does examining it lead you to consider for critical reflection in your context?
DRAFT Principles for Designing Critical Reflection in the Context of eTEAL
Each student will keep a running journal throughout the semester. The focus of the journal will be a particular nonhuman animal, a plant or type of plant, or a natural setting / place. The purpose of the journal is to help focus your attention on the role and significance of the selected animal/plant/place (and, indirectly, the natural world in general) in your life. Reserve Reading #1 (Bass) should be considered a model for the type of personal reflection the journal is to be a vehicle for.

You will add new sections to the journal continually throughout the semester, with periodic feedback from the instructor; and you will submit the complete, attractively bound journal for grading at the end of the semester; single- spaced type, photographs, drawings, poems, etc. are all encouraged as is going beyond the particular questions posed here in your reflection. The criteria for evaluation include depth of reflection, quality of linkages to course materials, and extent to which personal insights / experiences are developed and integrated. One single-spaced page per entry should be considered the minimum length, and you should set aside approx 1 hour to compose the first draft of each entry, with additional time to revise the drafts.

**Part I:** Identify the animal/plant/place selected as the focus of your journal. Explain your selection: Why is this particular animal/plant/place important to you? How is your relationship with it different than your relationship with other animals/plants/places that you did not select? In general terms, what does this relationship add to your life? Share at least one specific story from this relationship.

**Part II:** Spend some time with the animal/plant/place: look, touch, smell, listen. Describe in detail. Who IS this entity that you have this relationship with? What intellectual and emotional responses accompany your reflection? What specific memories, stories does this reflection elicit? (If you are unable to visit with your journal focus this semester, bring out photographs or recall vivid memories.)

**Part III:** Respond to the Bass reading. What memories, images, thoughts of your animal/plant/place do his stories bring to mind? In what ways are your experiences with this animal/plant/place similar to and/or different from the experiences Bass relates and why? This entry should include specific relevant quotes from Bass.

**Part IV:** Using as a model the “Others” reading, write a similar letter from your animal/plant/place to you. Put yourself in his/her/its place and creatively try to capture his/her/its perspective, his/her/its end of the relationship, his/ her/its interests and desires, his/her/its understanding of what the two of you bring to one another’s existence, etc.

**Part V:** To what extent and in what ways does your relationship with this animal/plant/place shape your personal identity? How would you be different as a person without this relationship? What are the most important lessons you have learned from this animal/plant/place and from your relationship with him or her? Again, share specific stories.

**Part VI:** To what extent and in what ways is this animal/plant/place an important part of your sense of family and community? How do you interact differently with others (human or nonhuman) because of what you have learned or ways you have grown in this relationship? Again, share specific stories.

**Part VII:** Think of a difficult question or issue you are facing in your life at the present time (or one you expect to face in the near future ... for example, how to deal with a conflict in your family, whether you plan to have a child, what you want to major in, whether you want to go to graduate school, problems you face at work, choosing a career field, an issue in a personal relationship, etc.). In your mind, take this issue to your journal focus and explore it there, with him/her/it. Then reflect on the issue from this virtual perspective (how do you think about the issue differently when you locate it here with your journal focus? does the resolution seem clearer or more difficult? what insights does this perspective bring to your thinking about the issue? etc.).
Part VIII: Respond to the environmental values discussion in general. What values are particularly associated with this animal/plant/place (or his or her species, or this type of place) -- in your own mind? in our society at large? What values would you draw on in order to convince someone to change the way they interact with this animal/plant/place?

Part IX: Interview someone who has a relationship with a similar animal/plant/place. How does this person view his or her relationship and how does this compare and contrast to your own experience? What do you think accounts for the similarities and differences? What do you most like or admire about this person’s experience in his or her relationship, and what about it, if anything, concerns you?

Part X: CAPSTONE ENTRY
Bass writes that “the land, and our stories, have marked us” and shares several examples of how his encounters with the Texas hill country have helped to form his understanding of, respect for, and treatment of the more-than-human world. In this capstone journal entry, you too are to tell your “story” (who you are, what you care about, what you most value, what you believe in, etc.) as it is a produce of your relationship with this animal/plant/place.

The specific question to launch this capstone entry is this: in what ways is your own environmental ethic a product of this relationship?

So, you will first need to identify elements of your personal environmental ethic, drawing on course material in compare / contrast mode to so (noting, for example, which of the specific ideas we have encountered this semester you find most meaningful in your own life and which you find least relevant) but not limiting yourself to concepts we have explored this semester if there are other elements of your environmental ethic which we have not touched on. You will need to identify and explain at least 5 such elements of your personal environmental ethic.

Then you will need to relate each of these elements of your personal environmental ethic to your relationship with your journal focus, identifying specific ways in which these elements have been shaped by this relationship. For example, perhaps you find the preservationist position more meaningful than the conservationist position and you can in part trace this element to an encounter with your journal focus at which point you appreciated his/her/its intrinsic value and began to question the anthropocentrism of your society. Or, for example, perhaps you find Taylor’s Rule of Fidelity meaningful in part because you once deceived your journal focus and then regretted having done so.

Once you have explored the extent to which this relationship has helped to shape your personal environmental ethic, move beyond this one relationship and consider how elements of your personal environmental ethic have been shaped by other relationships and experiences, with humans and non-humans alike. For example, perhaps you believe that respect for life suggests (or does not suggest) ending a life filled with suffering, whether a human or a nonhuman life, because of an experience you had watching a grandparent suffer through a terminal illness without recourse to euthanasia. Or, for example, perhaps you place great emphasis on the bequest value of the more-than-human world, not because of your relationship with your journal focus but because you grew up on a family farm and want to pass this experience along to your own children.

Conclude this capstone journal entry with an overview of the ways in which this personal environmental ethic will shape your life after this course. How, specifically, would you like your life to manifest the elements of your personal environmental ethic which you have been exploring here? What steps will you take to bring your choices more in line with your personal environmental ethic?

This capstone journal entry should be more involved and thus longer than the previous entries. A bit of repetition from earlier entries is acceptable (for example, you may reference here a particular story you shared in an earlier entry if it is pertinent to your discussion). Feel free to explore here any aspects of our course which you have not touched on earlier in the journal.
Example Other Approach #2: Welch’s ABC Model in Online Reflection

**ABC Model:** Reflection should focus students’ attention on the affective (A), behavioral (B), and cognitive/content (C) aspects of their experiences.

**Sample assignment (from Welch, 2007)**

Review the list and description of key cultural concepts in Chapter 2 of the text. Identify as many examples of those concepts you have encountered or observed in your service-learning experience. Give a brief description of the situation/context and include WHY you think this situation reflects the key cultural concepts presented in class/text [cognition]. Address how you feel about these experiences [affect]. Fearful? Resentful? Confused? Judgmental? How do you anticipate behaving in the future in a similar situation? Will you change? Why? How? [behavior].

**Sample assignment (from Patti’s course)**

The WebCT bulletin board labelled "summary posts" (one for each SL group) is your space to periodically summarize the service activities undertaken as part of your SL project and do some preliminary reflection on those activities and their connection to course material -- reflection that will be developed and deepened in class discussion, in your journal, and in Reflection Sessions. The entire set of summary posts will count 10% toward your final course grade, with posts not accepted late.

Each student will post to his/her group’s summary post bulletin board once a week, beginning the second week of class, by Friday at 5:00pm. The only exceptions are the week of Spring Break the week of Easter Break, and the week of final exams; unless circumstances lead us to decide otherwise, the last post will be due on Friday April 30.

Each time you post, please write 4 short paragraphs

- summarizing in fair detail your service experiences (what you have done, with an indication of the rationale for the activities) since the preceding post (note that some of these experiences may not be at the community site, given that some of our service is “behind-the-scenes”),
- **A:** exploring your own and others’ emotional responses to or interpretations of your experiences (NOTE: there are no “wrong” emotional responses here),
- **C:** noting (briefly) the (specific) course material that you believe relates to your experiences and might help you analyze them further, and
- **B:** noting (briefly) what you believe you should do differently in the future.

In short, a reader of your post should know what you did and why you did it, how you and others felt, what course material you think is relevant, and how you believe you might be able to improve the quality of future experiences.
More Thinking about Principles for Designing Critical Reflection

DEAL Model for Critical Reflection
[Ash & Clayton, 2009; various]

Engage in experience

Describe experience objectively

Examine per category

Learning Goal Category #1

Learning Goal Category #2

Learning Goal Category #3

Engage in experience and test learning and/or implement goals

Articulate Learning (incl setting goals) in each category
Critical Reflection Assignment (structured with DEAL) for Academic Learning (generic)

Describe a SL-related experience (objectively and in some detail)

- When did this experience take place?
- Where did it take place?
- Who else was there? Who wasn’t there?
- What did I do? What did others do? What actions did I / we take?
- What did I / we say or otherwise communicate?
- Who didn’t speak or act?
- Etc.

Examine that experience (academic learning)

- What specific academic material is relevant to this experience? Explain the concept, theory, etc clearly and concisely so that someone unfamiliar with it could understand it
- How did the material emerge in the experience (When did I see it or note its absence? How did or should I or someone else use it?)?
- What academic (e.g., disciplinary, intellectual, professional) skills did I use / should I have used? In what ways did I / others think from the perspective of a particular discipline and with what results?
- In what specific ways are my understanding of the material or skill and the experience the same and in what specific ways are they different? What are the possible reasons for the difference(s) (e.g., bias, assumptions, lack of information on my part or on the part of the author / instructor / community?)

Articulate Learning

“I learned that” …
- Express an important learning, not just a statement of fact
- Provide a clear and correct explanation of the concept(s) in question so that someone not in the experience could understand it
- Explain your enhanced understanding of the concept(s), as a result of reflection on the experience
- Be expressed in general terms, not just in the context of the experience (so that the learning can be applied more broadly to other experiences)

“I learned this when” …
- Connect the learning to specific activities that gave rise to it, making clear what happened in the context of that experience so that someone who wasn’t there could understand it

“This learning matters because” …
- Consider how the learning has value, both in terms of this situation and in broader terms, such as other organizations, communities, activities, issues, professional goals, courses, etc.

“In light of this learning” …
- Set specific and assessable goals; consider the benefits and challenges involved in fulfilling them
- Tie back clearly to the original learning statement.
Critical Reflection Assignment (structured with DEAL) for Personal Growth (generic)
(as in LTCR, PG category)

Describe a SL-related experience (objectively and in some detail)
- When did this experience take place? Where did it take place?
- Who else was there? Who wasn’t there?
- What did I do? What did others do? What actions did I / we take? What did I / we communicate?
- Who didn’t speak or act? Did I / others laugh, cry, make a face, etc.?

Examine that experience (personal growth) (Goal-based → Objective-based)
I. Surface a personal characteristic (excerpts)
   - What assumptions or expectations did I bring to the situation? How did they affect what I did or didn’t think, feel, decide, or do? To what extent did they prove true? If they did not prove true, why was there a discrepancy?
   - How did this experience make me feel (positively and/or negatively)? How did I handle my emotional reactions (e.g., what did I do as a result of my feelings)? Should I have felt differently? Why or why not?
   - In what ways did I experience difficulties (e.g., interacting with others, accomplishing tasks,) and what personal characteristics contributed to the difficulties (e.g., skills, abilities, perspectives, attitudes, tendencies, knowledge)? In what ways did I succeed or do well in this situation (e.g., interacting with others, accomplishing tasks, handling difficulties) and what personal characteristics helped me to be successful (e.g., skills, abilities, perspectives, attitudes, tendencies, knowledge)?
II. Develop understanding of that personal characteristic (using Bloom explicitly)
   1. Identify a personal characteristic that you are beginning to understand better
   2. Explain the characteristic (so that someone who does not know you would understand it).
   3. Apply: How does / might this characteristic positively and/or negatively affect your interactions with others, your decisions, and/or your actions in your service-learning activities and (as applicable) in other areas of your life?
   4. Analyze: What are the possible sources of / reasons for this characteristic? How does your understanding of these sources / reasons help you to better understand what will be involved in using, improving, or changing this characteristic in the future?

Articulate Learning
“*I learned that*” …
- Express an important learning, not just a statement of fact
- Provide a clear and correct explanation of the concept(s) in question so that someone not in the experience could understand it.
- Explain your enhanced understanding of the concept(s), as a result of reflection on the experience
- Be expressed in general terms, not just in the context of the experience (so that the learning can be applied more broadly to other experiences)

“*I learned this when*” …
- Connect the learning to specific activities that gave rise to it, making clear what happened in the context of that experience so that someone who wasn’t there could understand it.

“*This learning matters because*” …
- Consider how the learning has value, both in terms of this situation and in broader terms, such as other organizations, communities, activities, issues, professional goals, courses, etc.

“*In light of this learning*” …
- Set specific and assessable goals; consider the benefits and challenges involved in fulfilling them
- Tie back clearly to the original learning statement.
EXAMPLE DEAL-Based Reflection Activity

Learning goal: Participants will understand the key concepts discussed in this workshop

DESCRIBE

List concepts discussed in the workshop (write on the board; as a group)

EXAMINE

Prompt #1: What does each of these concepts mean, in your own words (write on notecards; discuss in pairs)?

Prompt #2: Provide an example of each of the concepts as it does or could emerge in your teaching (discuss in pairs).

Prompt #3: Draw a concept map to represent the relationships between these concepts, with labels, arrows, etc. on the lines connecting the concepts to one another (draw on the board; in small groups).

Prompt #4: What new dimensions/nuances do you now see in any of the concepts? What questions does this lead you to (about any of the concepts) (discuss in small groups)?

Prompt #5: What is the most significant change in your understanding of the concepts (discuss in pairs)?

ARTICULATE LEARNING (individually; in writing)

I learned that …

I learned this when …

This learning matters because …

In light of this I will …
Worksheet: Using DEAL to guide reflection on this workshop

DESCRIBE (objectively) - Who? What? When? Where?
- When did this experience take place? Where did it take place?
- Who else was there? Who wasn’t there?
- What did I do? What did others do? What actions did I/we take? What did I/we communicate?
- Who didn’t speak or act? Did I/others laugh, cry, make a face, etc.?

EXAMINE

Learning Goal = Understand power dynamics

Learning goal = Develop communication skills

ARTICULATE LEARNING
I learned that ...
I learned this when ...
This learning matters because ...
In light of this I will ...
Students will be able to think critically

Learning Goals

Critical Thinking Standards (Paul & Elder)
- Clarity
- Accuracy
- Precision
- Relevance
- Depth
- Breadth
- Logic
- Significance
- Fairness

Teaching & Learning Strategies

- Identify
- Explain
- Apply
- Analyze
- Synthesize
- Evaluate

Assessment Strategies
Teaching & Learning Strategy

A – Bloom-based prompts
B- Prompts to deepen reflection and cultivate critical thinking

DEAL Model Critical Thinking Standards Table excerpts (Ash & Clayton, 2009: various)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Critical Thinking Standard</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Associated questions to ask to check your thinking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Clarity                    | Expands on ideas, express ideas in another way, provides examples or illustrations where appropriate. | • Did I give an example?  
• Is it clear what I mean by this?  
• Could I elaborate further? |
| Accuracy                   | All statements are factually correct and/or supported with evidence. | • How do I know this?  
• Is this true?  
• How could I check on this or verify it? |
| Precision                  | Statements contain specific information | • Can I be more specific?  
• Have I provided sufficient detail? |
| Relevance                  | All statements are relevant to the question at hand; all statements connect to the central point. | • How does this relate to the issue being discussed?  
• How does this help us/me deal with the issue being discussed? |
| Depth                      | Explains the reasons behind conclusions and anticipates and answers the questions that the reasoning raises and/or acknowledges the complexity of the issue. | • Why is this so?  
• What are some of the complexities here?  
• What would it take for this to happen?  
• Would this be easy to do? |
| Breadth                    | Considers alternative points of view or how someone else might have interpreted the situation. | • Would this look the same from the perspective of…?  
• Is there another way to interpret what this means? |
| Logic                      | The line of reasoning makes sense and follows from the facts and/or what has been said. | • Does what I said at the beginning fit with what I concluded at the end?  
• Do my conclusions match the evidence that I have presented?” |
| Significance                | The conclusions or goals represent a (the) major issue raised by the reflection on experience. | • Is this the most important issue to focus on?  
• Is this most significant problem to consider? |
| Fairness                    | Other points of view are represented with integrity (without bias or distortion) | • Have I represented this viewpoint in such a way that the person who holds it would agree with my characterization? |
### Assessment Strategy

**Feedback on and grading of reflection products**

DEAL Model Critical Thinking Rubric excerpts (Ash & Clayton, 2009; various)


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(1)</th>
<th>(2)</th>
<th>(3)</th>
<th>(4)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Accuracy</strong></td>
<td>Consistently makes inaccurate statements and/or fails to provide supporting evidence for claims</td>
<td>Makes several inaccurate statements and/or supports few statements with evidence</td>
<td>Usually but not always makes statements that are accurate and well-supported with evidence</td>
<td>Consistently makes statements that are accurate and well-supported with evidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Clarity</strong></td>
<td>Consistently fails to provide examples, to illustrate points, to define terms, and/or to express ideas in other ways</td>
<td>Only occasionally provides examples, illustrates points, defines terms, and/or expresses ideas in other ways</td>
<td>Usually but not always provides examples, illustrates points, defines terms, and/or expresses ideas in other ways</td>
<td>Consistently provides examples, illustrates points, defines terms, and/or expresses ideas in other ways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Depth</strong></td>
<td>Fails to address salient questions that arise from statements being made; consistently over-simplifies when making connections; fails to consider any of the complexities of the issue</td>
<td>Addresses few of the salient questions that arise from statements being made; often over-simplifies when making connections; considers little of the complexity of the issue</td>
<td>Addresses some but not all of the salient questions that arise from statements being made; rarely over-simplifies when making connections; considers some but not all of the full complexity of the issue</td>
<td>Thoroughly addresses salient questions that arise from statements being made; avoids over-simplifying when making connections; considers the full complexity of the issue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Breadth</strong></td>
<td>Ignores or superficially considers alternative points of view and/or interpretations</td>
<td>Gives minimal consideration to alternative points of view and/or interpretations and makes very limited use of them in shaping the learning</td>
<td>Gives some consideration to alternative points of view and/or interpretations and makes some use of them in shaping the learning</td>
<td>Gives meaningful consideration to alternative points of view and/or interpretations and makes very good use of them in shaping the learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fairness</strong></td>
<td>Consistently represents others’ perspectives in a biased or distorted way</td>
<td>Occasionally represents others’ perspectives in a biased or distorted way</td>
<td>Often but not always represents others’ perspectives with integrity</td>
<td>Consistently represents others’ perspectives with integrity (without bias or distortion)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Bloom-based Rubric (excerpt): Academic Enhancement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Identifies a specific academic concept that you now understand better as a result of reflection on experience</strong></td>
<td>Explains the academic concept (so that someone not in your class would understand it)</td>
<td>Applies: Considers how this academic concept emerges in your experience? (E.g., When did you see it, or note its absence? How did, or could, you or someone else use it?)</td>
<td>Analyzes: Compares and contrasts your initial understanding of the academic concept in light of your experience of it</td>
<td>Develops an enhanced understanding of the academic concept in light of the experience</td>
<td>Evaluates the completeness of the concept and/or of your understanding of the concept and/or of its use by you or others</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Bloom-based Rubric (excerpt): Personal Growth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Identifies a personal characteristic that you now understand better as a result of reflection on experience</strong></td>
<td>Explains the personal characteristic (so that someone who does not know you would understand it)</td>
<td>Applies: Considers how this personal characteristic does/might positively and/or negatively affect your interactions with others, your decisions, and/or your actions in your project and in other areas of your life</td>
<td>Analyzes the sources of this personal characteristic</td>
<td>Develops the steps necessary to use, improve upon, or otherwise change this personal characteristic in the short term, in project and in other areas of your life</td>
<td>Evaluates your strategies for personal growth over the long term</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Integrating Critical Reflection and Assessment

Student reflection products – 4 examples (excerpted)

A-
“Being effective at improving the lives of a group of disadvantaged people includes not only being good at the specific task or activity we are bringing to the community, but also making them feel special and loved. This helps to make them more receptive to our efforts. It became clear that the more we got to know the kids and showed them that we actually cared about them, the more willing they were to pay attention to us and their homework. For example, when I first started working with William, he wouldn’t even look at me or acknowledge my presence. But every week I brought him little gifts, like candy and stickers, and slowly he began to warm up to me so that now he runs up when I come in and is ready to get to work... This matters because underprivileged children are not getting the attention that they need at home....”

B-
“I was not used to working with so many kids. This made me nervous and I do not like being nervous. This is important to know because I know that in the future I do not want to have a job that requires me to work with children. After I worked with them for a few weeks and got to know them the nervousness wore off and I became comfortable. This was important because it allowed me to be the best role model I could be.”

C-
“I learned that when working with other people I try not to impose on them by making them feel any unwanted sense of commitment or obligation to do extra work. I feel that this has become a weakness for me because it creates some uncertainty surrounding my interactions with others by not fostering the formation of well-defined goals and firm deadlines.

I learned this by looking back at e-mails and letters I have recently written to people and seeing how open-ended I leave them. Karen (my fellow SL group member) pointed out to me that Ms. Black said about the letter that I gave her that she was not sure what needed to be done with it. In looking at that letter and the ones we gave to Dr. Jones (the principal at the school) and Sue (the parent we are partnering with), I realized that there was only one mention of any action that needed to be taken, and even that was not emphasized. Because I have not heard back from neither Dr. Jones nor Sue and only heard from Ms. Black because I directly approached her, it is a fair assessment to say that the letter did not lay out my goals and purpose clearly enough to push these people toward action.

This learning matters because I have seen that my hesitancy to directly ask people to perform a task or even to merely provide a response has negatively affected my interactions with others by limiting my productivity because of a lack of directedness, which might be further complicated if people interpret this lack of forcefulness as a sign of me having little passion for the project and thus not motivating them to action or possibly not establishing reliable communication to give them the opportunity to take part in the process. However, this can also be looked at as a strength when operating within the model of service-learning because this tendency to refrain from imposing on others should ensure that I do not overstep my bounds and take full control of the project and neglect the community partners’ wishes.

[In light of this learning.] In the future, I will try to be more goal-directed in my correspondences with others and try to establish a sense of accountability on their side of the partnership so that we may
work in a reciprocal relationship where I can clearly lay out our goals and deadlines while also respecting the individual and his or her input. While the line between being too forceful and being respectful of the individual is blurry, I believe it comes when both parties are not receiving mutual benefits from the partnership and when any member of the partnership drowns someone’s voice out. Setting reasonable deadlines for replies or steps toward action when asking for assistance is a solution, but when doing this, I will need to remain conscious of when my aversion for imposing on others is hindering my intentions to be more forceful.”

D-

One main attribute we have discussed that a servant-leader should have is foresight, or the ability to anticipate what will happen based on patterns observed from the past .... In “The Servant as Leader,” Robert Greenleaf says that foresight is “the ‘lead’ that the leader has” and that “once he loses this lead and events start to force his hand...he is not leading (18).” However, I have learned that although our group has lacked foresight in some aspects of this project and that to a certain extent events are limiting our choices as servant-leaders, we have not totally “lost our lead” ... and we still have the choice of how we will respond to the current status of the project.

I learned this when we discussed the challenges we were experiencing with the project ... We talked about how we were discouraged that our lack of foresight had caused us to waste a lot of time trying to fix technological problems at the sites when we should be working on sustainability for the project. ... We realized that we may not be able to firmly establish a new and permanent “home” program to take on the responsibility of the computer project or fix all the technological problems that still exist at the sites. We felt that we had no choice but to simply give up these objectives—that is, that our lack of foresight had taken away our “lead”—since the pressure we were experiencing from time seemed to be forcing our hand and leaving us no options. However, [our instructor] asked us if not being able to completely fulfill an objective meant that we could not progress towards it at all. This question helped us to realize that while we may not be able to fully complete everything we wanted to with this project, we still can make interim steps towards those goals. We can establish preliminary contact with possible “home” programs for the project and compile a report of these options. We can locate a source of technical support ... for future participants in the project who will be able to take care of the technological problems we cannot fix. In short, our choice of actions at this point may be limited by our lack of foresight earlier on in the project, but we still ... can direct the progress of this project before our involvement with it ends.

This learning matters because it has reinforced both to me and to my group members the importance of foresight when trying to achieve goals and also caused us to find alternate ways of working towards those goals when our lack of foresight brings us into situations of limited options. ... My group and I discovered that we do not agree that lacking foresight causes a leader to “lose [his or her] lead” as Greenleaf states. ... Even though our efforts ... have been compromised by our lack of foresight ... we can utilize other leadership skills to retain our “lead” in this project. We can ... be flexible and learn to work within the limitations that our lack of foresight has resulted in.

In light of this learning I will spend some time after our meeting with the [organization’s] manager to foresee what situations may come up in the last five weeks of this project, write these ideas down, and share them with my group members ... Since there are so many challenges and changes that may yet arise in this project, it will be hard to predict them. ... As Greenleaf states, foresight often requires a leader to have a “feel for patterns (15),” and one important way for me to recognize and sense patterns in the progress of this project is by reflecting on my past experiences and current involvement with this project. Also, I can be thinking of what choices still remain for us as we seek to come as close to completing our objectives for this project as possible, and how we can act upon these choices.
First Draft Articulated Learning, excerpts (Personal Growth Category)

I learned that my dependency and reliance on our site coordinator's presence caused me to be less effective when she was not at the assisted living facility.

I learned this when my group member and I went to the assisted living facility on Friday and were not able to accomplish all of our objectives because the site coordinator was not there like she had told us last week she would be.....

----

In light of this learning I will have a backup plan in case the site coordinator is not available next time I visit the assisted living facility. I will try not to be as dependent upon her to get my objectives accomplished by realizing that I need to be a leader and have a plan for taking the initiative to accomplish my goals. Also, in light of the fact that others are often dependent upon me, I will try to make sure that I do not cause them to be less effective by keeping my promises and fulfilling my obligations.

Final Draft Articulated Learning, excerpts (Personal Growth Category)

[NOTE: refined through two drafts, with feedback from peers and instructor; slightly modified from original]

I learned that for the past twenty years I have been developing a pattern of inappropriate dependency in that I easily default to depending on other people, relying on them to help me accomplish my objectives even if I do not really know them well enough to trust them. However when I get backed into a corner because of this dependency, I have the capability to handle it because of my resourcefulness, or my ability to find alternate ways to accomplish my objectives when situations are not conducive to meeting those objectives.

I learned this when I compared the dependency problem that I faced in the Dominican Republic with the situation at the assisted living facility last week when I depended on the Activity Coordinator's presence and she was not there. When I volunteered at an orphanage in the Dominican Republic... Last week at the assisted living facility I encountered another example of my tendency to be too dependent on others when I counted on the Activity Coordinator to be at the site to introduce my group to the residents and wasted a lot of time waiting around for her rather than going to a "Plan B" quickly. Even though I defaulted into dependency, however, I was able to be resourceful to overcome the problem created by my dependency, by eventually locating someone else who was able to introduce us like I had hoped the Activity Coordinator would do.

This learning matters because now that I am in college, I am at a point in my life when I need to become independent in order to be able to function on my own, and though I am now better able
to use my resources to pull myself out of a problem created by dependency, it would be more sustainable if I could prevent myself from defaulting into dependency by bolstering my independence..... However it is important for me to realize through this example of my resourcefulness at the assisted living facility that the reason I default to dependency is not because I cannot handle the problem or situation myself, it’s that my lifelong reliance on my parents as rescuers has led me to believe that I am not independent and strong enough to do it. It is this underlying belief that I will need to work on if I am to become a more independent adult.

In light of this learning I will set small goals for myself to become more independent. I think that my decision to go to the Dominican Republic by myself was a step of independence that was too large for me to take so I will find ways to push myself towards independence, realizing that it’s a process that begins with small steps. For example, in the past I have been dependent on my brother to get gas in my car, but in light of this learning I will resolve to get my own gas. Also, I have been financially dependent on my parents and have come to depend on them to give me money every week to buy necessary items for the week. Because I want to become more independent, I will talk to my mother and work out a system where she gives me a set amount of money for the rest of the semester and I will have to budget it out for myself on a week by week basis....

... Another more fundamental challenge will be to back away from these safety nets, such as my parents giving my money and my brother getting my gas, while not backing away from the individuals who care enough about me to be safety nets. I do want to back away from my dependence on my parents and brother, for example, but I must be careful not to back away from my parents and brother in the process. I think that by talking to them and explaining my desire to become more independent, I can let them know that I sincerely appreciate their support but at the same time need to learn to rely more upon myself. To ensure that I really do make progress in terms of these goals in the next six months, I will put a notebook in my car and record who gets gas each time my car needs to be filled ....
Designing a Reflection Strategy: When, Where, Who, Why, and on What?

- **Beginning of the course**
- **Middle of the course**
- **End of the course**
Building into your Strategy Learning How to Learn through Reflection

Challenges of learning through reflection on experience ...

Learning through reflection involves ...

➢ What knowledge?

➢ What skills?

➢ What attitudes / dispositions / values?

Possibilities for cultivating the ability to learn through reflection ...

➢ First day of class activities

➢ Other?
Worksheet :: Designing Your eTEAL Critical Reflection

1. Draft your ideas, drawing on all that we have discussed today and your application to your own context (if desired, use worksheet on page 35 to work on DEAL prompts)
2. Share your ideas and questions with a partner at your table
3. Critique one another’s ideas and explore one another’s questions

(over)
Worksheet :: Designing Your eTEAL Critical Reflection (cont.)

4. Refine your ideas and questions
5. Identify challenges and opportunities to share with the group for discussion
Worksheet: Designing EXAMINE Prompts

DESCRIBE (objectively) - Who? What? When? Where?
- When did this experience take place? Where did it take place?
- Who else was there? Who wasn’t there?
- What did I do? What did others do? What actions did I / we take? What did I / we communicate?
- Who didn’t speak or act? Did I / others laugh, cry, make a face, etc.?

EXAMINE (NOTE: Learning goal = _____________________________)

ARTICULATE LEARNING
I learned that …

I learned this when …

This learning matters because …

In light of this I will …
APPENDIX A: 10 Tips for Designing Critical Reflection

1. “Everything is reflection-worthy”: Few if any details are too small or insignificant to have meaning, and all experiences—whether designed for learning or serendipitous—as well as readings, observations, events, etc. present opportunities for a wide range of learning.

2. Critical reflection is the part of experiential learning that generates, deepens, and documents learning. When used in this capacity, it needs to be understood not as “touchy-feely,” non-grade-able, private, stream-of-consciousness but rather as a reasoning process that is analytical, integrative, assessable, subject to public critique, and structured/guided.

3. Critical reflection can generate learning outcomes that include knowledge, skills, attitudes/values, and behaviors. If it is to generate assessable learning, critical reflection should be guided in accordance with the desired learning outcomes.

4. Reflection can be guided by a facilitator orally, by a set of written prompts, or by other methods. This guidance should enable the learner to generate learning and then assist them in articulating it coherently and cohesively, in part so as to inform future learning and action.

5. Reflection activities can be written or oral or both, and they can be individual or collaborative or both; perhaps the strongest reflection combines all four possibilities. Reflection can involve physical movement, drawing, audio-visual elements … the possibilities are limited only by the facilitator’s creativity.

6. Critical reflection can be designed iteratively and therefore build on itself cumulatively. Relatedly, it is helpful to use a pre-mid-post structure that focuses the learner’s attention on changes in his/her assumptions and reasoning processes and on progress toward fulfilling objectives.

7. An overall reflection strategy may integrate multiple reflection mechanisms. A reflection strategy answers the questions
   a. “When do we reflect?” (at what points during the experience or course or project)
   b. “Why do we reflect?” (toward what learning objectives)
   c. “Where do we reflect?” (in what settings, geographic or virtual)
   d. “Who reflects?” (learners alone or together, with facilitators, with other participants)
   A reflection mechanism answers the question: “How do we reflect?” (with what guidance, in what structure)

8. It is useful to begin designing a reflection strategy or mechanism by considering such questions as:
   a. Who are the learners (what experience, skills, etc. do they bring and not bring)?
   b. Who is the facilitator, if there is one (what experience, skills, etc. does he/she bring and not bring)?
   c. What are the objectives?
   d. What are the constraints?

9. Reflection requires a “safe yet critical” space: the risks associated with meaning making need to be acknowledged and minimized while adhering to high standards of reasoning. While reflection is not about generating one right answer, not all reasoning is equally valid. Reflection can be used to support learners in making reasoned judgments that are well-supported with evidence and that result from consideration of multiple perspective—not merely expressing opinions.

10. Learning through critical reflection is often an unfamiliar (counter-normative) process, which requires intentional capacity-building: many learners need to learn how to learn through critical reflection. Facilitators modeling reflection can be an important part of such capacity-building and can enhance their own learning as well.
APPENDIX B:  
Cultivating “Safe Yet Critical” Spaces for Reflection

What can make a reflection space “unsafe”?

How can a reflection space be made “safe”?

What makes a reflection space “un-critical”?

How can a reflection space be made “critical”?

How can a reflection space be made “safe yet critical”?
## APPENDIX C:
Paradigm Shift in Higher Education - Contexts for Thinking about EL/AL as Counter-normative Pedagogy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Traditional T&amp;L</th>
<th>Emerging Approaches to T &amp; L</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Technocratic</strong></td>
<td><strong>Democratic</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deficit-based</td>
<td>Asset-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>For</em></td>
<td><em>With</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uni-directional flow of knowledge from credentialed academic experts</td>
<td>Multi-directional flow of knowledge within a web of knowledge centers who share authority for knowledge creation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distinction between knowledge producers and knowledge consumers</td>
<td>Co-creation of knowledge; capacity building for collaborative knowledge production and action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Often transactional exchanges</td>
<td>Potentially mutually-transformative partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hierarchy / traditional power dynamics</td>
<td>Co-roles and identities / powershift</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Select Related Publications (Clayton)


Select Additional References


